



Historic District Commission

Meeting Minutes Draft – DRAFT

May 7, 2026, at 6:00 P.M.

Saugatuck City Hall, 102 Butler St, Saugatuck, MI 49453

1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 6:00 p.m. by Chair Straker.

2. Roll Call

Members Present: Baldwin, Cannarsa, Dean, Lampen, Root, Paterson, & Straker

Members Absent: None

Staff Present: Planning & Zoning Director Moore

Others Present: None

3. Agenda Changes/Additions/Deletions

None

4. Approval of Minutes

Motion by Paterson, supported by Cannarsa, to approve the April 2, 2026, minutes as presented. Via voice vote, motion carried unanimously.

5. Public Comment

None

6. Unfinished Business

None

7. New Business

A. 640 Water St – New Construction

The commission's discussion on 640 Water Street focused on confirming that demolition of the existing building is explicitly approved and reviewing the exterior materials for the new structure. The applicant, Daniel Boggs, presented samples and a new sheet showing storefront framing, aluminum-clad wood windows (likely Pella, in black), silver metal siding referencing historic fishing tugs, painted nickel-gap wood siding, cable railings, standing-

seam metal roofing on dormers, and asphalt shingles elsewhere. Commissioners noted that while natural wood siding (pine) meets the guidelines, its durability and maintenance in Michigan weather are questionable, and they encouraged consideration of more stable alternatives such as fiber-cement, LP, or Boral with a smooth, non-stamped profile. A substantial portion of the discussion addressed the trash/dumpster enclosure – its prominent location on a highly visible site, the tendency of such enclosures to become unsightly, and the need for its materials to match or coordinate with the primary building cladding. Ultimately, the commission agreed to approve the demolition and the new building conditionally, requiring the applicant to submit a full specification packet for windows and doors (including the round units), metal roofing and shingles, and the dumpster enclosure materials for staff-level review and approval before the project can proceed.

Motion by Lampen, supported by Root, to approve the applicant's request for the demolition of the existing building at 640 Water Street, construction of a new building as presented in the application and supporting materials subject to submittal of the spec packet for:

- 1. the windows and doors, the opening (including the round windows)*
- 2. the manufacturer make & color of the exterior materiality, more information on the metal roof (black shingle)*
- 3. the materiality of the dumpster enclosure.*

Upon voice vote, motion carried unanimously.

B. 525 Butler – Garage Interior

The commission's discussion on the garage exterior at 525 Butler Street centered on the proposed "facelift" to better match the relatively new front addition of the house. The applicant explained that the existing older, vinyl-clad garage would receive new composite shingles and trim to match the house, a new eyebrow roof over the garage door, and additional windows. The commissioners generally supported the overall upgrade and matching materials, but several expressed concern that the proposed garage door – a pressed-metal door meant to look like stained cedar with arched windows – did not align with the historic guidelines that discourage stamped "fake wood" products and suburban-style detailing. Suggestions included using a white door and eliminating the arched windows so it would be more compatible with the house and streetscape, while others noted the door could still be metal if it did not mimic wood grain.

Motion by Baldwin, supported by Paterson, to approve the applicant's request for the exterior remodeling of the existing garage, including new siding, trim,

windows, garage door, and eyebrow roof, as proposed, based on the application meeting the applicable Historic District guidelines, and subject to the submission of the garage door that would meet historic guidelines and staff approval. Upon voice vote, motion carried unanimously.

C. 673 Lake - Hardscaping

The commission's discussion of the hardscaping at 673 Lake Street focused on replacing the existing driveway and adding a small turnaround while coordinating with previously approved backyard work. The applicant explained that the new driveway would be brick (matching the rear patios), with a concrete apron at the street to handle truck traffic, and that the new turnaround area would use an aqua-paver style permeable system that allows grass or similar material to grow through, improving stormwater management. Commissioners asked clarifying questions about where the different materials would be used, confirmed that the proposed stone planters and pavers would match the materials already installed in the rear yard, and expressed appreciation for the permeable paving approach and the effort to keep all hardscape elements consistent in color and character.

Motion by Paterson, supported by Baldwin, to approve the applicant's request for replacement of the existing driveway, construction of a turnaround, replacement of the front porch surface and installation of a planter box as proposed. Upon voice vote, motion carried unanimously.

D. 145 Grant – Exterior Addition & Renovations

The commission's discussion on the exterior addition and renovations at 145 Grant Street focused on the applicant's comprehensive plan to "clean up" and modernize a non-contributing house using smooth, historically compatible materials while enclosing the existing porch and adding a detached garage. The applicant detailed a materials palette of smooth LP or similar panel with batten strips, Boral/true-exterior trim, smooth metal fascia, asphalt shingles, and metal roofing accents, along with new aluminum-clad wood windows and functional-proportion shutters, and PVC flower boxes for longevity. Commissioners commended the thoroughness of the submittal and the clear effort to improve the building's character, noting that the work would make the house more compatible with the district rather than less. Discussion touched briefly on window patterns, the blank side of the garage (with options such as landscaping or future detailing), and the need to decide between the alternative siding products.

Motion by Baldwin, supported by Dean, to approve the applicant's request for exterior renovations to the existing principal structure, including porch

enclosure, replacement of siding, windows, doors, trim, soffit, fascia, and roofing materials, as well as the construction of a detached garage and associated site improvements, including fencing, lighting, shutters, and landscaping, as proposed based on the applicant meeting the applicable Historic District guidelines. Additionally, approval shall be subject to the following conditions: Spec sheets of windows, doors, and siding, submitted for staff approval. Upon voice vote, motion carried unanimously.

8. Administrative Approvals & Updates

A. 721 Lake – Stair Replacement

9. Communication

None.

10. Public Comments

None.

11. Commission Comments

None.

12. Adjournment

Motion by Root, supported by Cannarsa, to adjourn at 6:53 p.m. Via voice vote, motion carried unanimously.

Submitted by:

Sara Williams

Deputy Clerk

City of Saugatuck