



City of Saugatuck
Historic District Commission
Special Meeting Minutes October 16, 6:00 PM
Saugatuck City Hall
102 Butler Street

Call to Order/Roll Call: Chair Straker called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

Present: Chairman Straker, Commission members: Cannarsa, Donahue, Gardner, Godfrey, Lampen, & Paterson.

Absent: None.

Others Present: Director of Planning & Zoning Thompson, Deputy Clerk Williams.

Approval of Minutes for September 5, 2024, Meeting:

Motion by Paterson, second by Donahue, to approve the special minutes for the September 5, 2024, meeting minutes. Upon voice vote, the motion was carried unanimously.

Public Comments:

- Mark Klungle (747 Water): Klungle spoke regarding project at 149 (Lucy).

Unfinished Business: None.

New Business:

A. 149 Lucy St – Addition to principal dwelling.

The applicant proposes an 850 square foot second story to an existing dwelling at 149 Lucy. The property is located in the Center Residential R-4 Zoning District and Historic District. The dwelling is not listed as a contributing resource.

The applicant, Barry Chesterton, stated that the purpose of the addition is to provide more room for his family, as they have four children and two grandchildren, so they need the extra space to accommodate everyone when they are all together.

The board went into deliberation with Straker explained to the Commission that they are making a decision around a base of non-contributing and contributing, not a lot that in non-conforming. That is not their purview. The fact that it sits on a lot line does not matter to them. What they look at is the scale of what is being done while taking into account where it sits on the lot and its adjacency to the other buildings around it.

Cannarsa mentioned the materiality stating that he does not think the proposed polycarbonate roof material fits the historic district, even though it is a non-contributing property. Lampen agreed with Cannarsa, noting that the HDC guidelines do not list polycarbonate as an approved roofing material, and it could be considered a type of skylight, which is discouraged. Gardner expressed concerns about the scale and compatibility of the proposed addition with the surrounding buildings. He felt the addition may not be in compliance with the standards for visual and historical context. Godfrey echoed concerns about scale and how the addition will fit with neighboring properties, especially the Mill Pond Realty and the house across the street. Donahue did not have any issues with the scale but agreed with the preference for a metal roof over the polycarbonate option. Paterson also discussed the roof material, asking about the existing front overhang and whether modifications were planned there. Chair Straker then provided his perspective, stating he does not have an issue with the massing or scale of the second story addition. However, he expressed concerns about introducing additional materials like polycarbonate or standing seam metal roof, preferring to keep the same roof material as the existing house. The discussion continued with the commissioners weighing the materiality, scale, and compatibility of the proposed addition within the context of the surrounding neighborhood.

Motion by Donahue, second by Cannarsa, to approve the second story addition, in accordance with the plans and details submitted within the application materials. Approval shall include the use of either asphalt or metal roof, not the polycarbonate that exists on the porch.

Upon roll call vote, motion carried 6-1.

Yeas: Cannarsa, Donahue, Godfrey, Lampen, Paterson, Straker

Nays: Gardner.

B. 229 Francis St – Replacement doors, deck, and concrete flatwork:

The applicant proposes replacement doors, deck, and concrete flatwork at 229 Francis Street. The property is located in the Community Residential R-1 Zoning District and Historic District. Although the dwelling is not listed as a contributing resource, the contributing resource report lists it as a cottage-style building constructed prior to 1900. It is assumed that construction projects over the years resulted in a non-contributing status.

The applicant, Liz Amundson stated that the existing deck at 229 Francis Street is rotting and bouncy, even though she has been maintaining it yearly. She said that the deck needs to be replaced due to its poor condition. Liz explained that the replacement will use concrete, and the dimensions will remain the same as the existing deck. She also mentioned that the front landing and side landing will be replaced with concrete to match the new deck.

The Commissioners discussed the material choices and the importance of maintaining the property's historical character. Straker commented that he is surprised the home is listed as non-contributing, since it seems so historically intact. He said that often when an application comes before the commission for a non-contributing property, the commissioners will discuss whether it should actually be considered contributing instead. He added that if the applicant came back with plans to alter windows or other major elements, the commission may have that contributing

vs. non-contributing conversation, even though it's currently listed as non-contributing because the house has such architectural integrity that the commission would want to celebrate and preserve. Cannarsa agreed, saying that even though the house is currently considered non-contributing, the changes the applicant is making are actually making it more contributing by preserving architectural integrity. The applicant confirmed that she was told the home was built in 1901, so the commissioners agreed they appreciate her efforts to be a good steward of the historical property.

Motion by Gardner, second by Cannarsa to approve the application as presented. Upon voice vote, motion carried unanimously.

C. Village Square Park – Install benches on concrete pads around Village Square:

The City Manager, on behalf of the City of Saugatuck, proposes to re-install benches on concrete pads around the Village Square Park. The subject property is located within the City Center C-1 Zoning District and the Historic District. The same benches were placed around the previous playground area.

Cummins explained that the concrete contractor is lined up to install the concrete pads for the benches before the end of the month, so the benches could be installed in the next couple of weeks.

Gardner noted that the image on page 42 shows the old playground, and the benches that were previously on the north side will now be placed on the south side instead. Lampen presumed this was because the previous location was too close to the property line. The commissioners confirmed there will be a total of 4-5 benches placed on the new concrete pads on the south side of the park.

Motion by Paterson, second by Godfrey to approve the location of the concrete pads and benches at Village Square Park. Upon voice vote, motion carried unanimously.

Administrative Approvals & Updates: None.

Communication: None.

Public Comment:

- Helen Baldwin – Thanked the commission for approving the park benches for Village Square Park.

Commission Comments:

- Godfrey – She questioned when the benches would be installed. City Manager Cummins confirmed that the concrete contractor would be pouring the concrete pads before the end of the month and the benches would be installed within the next couple of weeks.
- Cannarsa – He asked if there have been any administrative approvals within the last month. He said that there was a property that the Commission approved that has been under construction for about two years and he noticed a big load of concrete blocks in

the driveway, and he doesn't know what they were for. He was wondering if there was an administrative approval for that. Director of Planning & Zoning Thompson said that he would follow-up.

Adjourn:

Motion by Gardner, second by Godfrey to adjourn. Upon voice vote, motion carried unanimously. Chairman Straker adjourned the meeting at 6:49 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted by,
Sara Williams

Deputy Clerk